## As Passed by the House

## 125th General Assembly Regular Session 2003-2004

Sub. H. B. No. 282

Representatives Flowers, Martin, Seitz, Setzer, Allen, G. Smith, Daniels, Driehaus, Faber, Fessler, Gibbs, Hughes, Koziura, T. Patton, Seaver, Sferra, White, Wolpert, Woodard, Barrett, Book, Brown, Calvert, Carano, Cirelli, Clancy, Collier, DeBose, Distel, Domenick, C. Evans, D. Evans, Gilb, Hagan, Hartnett, Harwood, Hollister, Hoops, Jerse, Key, Mason, Miller, Niehaus, Oelslager, Olman, Reidelbach, Schaffer, Schlichter, Schmidt, S. Smith, D. Stewart, J. Stewart, Strahorn, Taylor, Widener, Willamowski, Wilson, Yates

## A BILL

То	amend sections 3903.28 and 3903.32 and to enact	1
	sections 3929.62, 3929.63, 3929.631, 3929.632,	2
	3929.64, 3929.65, 3929.66, 3929.661, 3929.67,	3
	3929.68, 3929.681, 3929.682, 3929.69, and 3929.70	4
	of the Revised Code to lengthen the time period	5
	during which the liquidator of an insolvent	6
	insurance company may void certain preferential	7
	transfers, to provide for the establishment of a	8
	Medical Liability Underwriting Association for	9
	medical liability insurance, and to make an	10
	appropriation.	11

## BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

Sect	tion 1. Th	at section	ons 3903.28	3 and 3903	.32 be amer	nded and	12
sections	3929.62,	3929.63,	3829.631,	3929.632,	3929.64,	3929.65,	13
3929.66,	3929.661,	3929.67,	3929.68,	3929.681,	3929.682,	3929.69,	14

and 3929.70 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as follows:	15
Sec. 3903.28. (A)(1) A preference is a transfer of any of the	16
property of an insurer or of an interest in the property of an	17
<u>insurer</u> to or for the benefit of a creditor, for or on account of	18
an antecedent debt, made or suffered by the insurer within one	19
<del>year two years</del> before the <del>filing of a successful</del> complaint <del>for</del>	20
liquidation under sections 3903.01 to 3903.59 of the Revised Code,	21
the effect of which transfer may be to enable the creditor to	22
obtain a greater percentage of his debt than another creditor of	23
the same class would receive. If a liquidation order is entered	24
while the insurer is already subject to a rehabilitation order,	25
then such transfer shall be deemed preferences if made or suffered	26
within one year before the filing of the successful complaint for	27
rehabilitation, or within two years before the filing of the	28
successful complaint for liquidation, whichever time is shorter	29
date that enables the creditor to receive more than the creditor	30
would receive if the insurer was liquidated under this chapter,	31
the transfer had not been made, and the creditor received payment	32
of the debt to the extent provided by the provisions of this	33
<u>chapter</u> .	34
(2) Any preference may be avoided by the liquidator if any of	35
the following apply:	36
(a) The insurer was insolvent at the time of the transfer;	37
	2.0
(b) The transfer was made within four months one hundred	38
twenty days before the filing of the complaint date;	39
(c) The creditor receiving it or to be benefited thereby or	40
his the creditor's agent acting with reference thereto had, at the	41
time when the transfer was made, reasonable cause to believe that	42
the insurer was insolvent or was about to become insolvent;	43
(d) The creditor receiving it was an officer, or any of the	44

Sub. H. B. No. 282 As Passed by the House	Page 3
<pre>following:</pre>	45
(i) An officer or director of the insurer;	46
(ii) A person, including but not limited to an employee or	47
attorney <del>or other person,</del> who was in fact in a position <del>of</del>	48
comparable influence in to effect a level of control over the	49
actions of the insurer comparable to that of an officer or	50
director whether or not he the person held such position, or any	51
but excluding employees of the department of insurance and any	52
person retained or appointed by the department to assist in the	53
examination, supervision, or other regulation or monitoring of the	54
<u>insurer;</u>	55
(iii) A shareholder holding directly or indirectly more than	56
five per cent of any class of any equity security issued by the	57
insurer <del>, or any</del> :	58
(iv) Any other person, firm, corporation, association, or	59
aggregation of persons with whom the insurer did not deal at arm's	60
length.	61
(3) Where the preference is voidable, the liquidator may	62
recover the property or the value of the property from the initial	63
transferee, and if it the property has been transferred or	64
converted, its the liquidator may recover the property or the	65
value of the property from any person who has received $\frac{\partial \mathbf{r}}{\partial \mathbf{r}}$	66
converted the property, except that a subsequent bona fide	67
purchaser or lienor who has given consideration of less than fair	68
equivalent value has a lien upon the property to the extent of the	69
consideration actually given. Where a preference by way of lien or	70
security title is voidable, the court may on due notice order the	71
such lien or title to be is preserved for the benefit of the	72
estate, in which event the lien or title shall pass to the	73
liquidator.	74
(4) The liquidator may not avoid a transfer under this	75

Sub. H. B. No. 282

on account of an antecedent debt if any acts required by the

applicable law to be performed in order to perfect the transfer as

136

137

against liens or bona fide purchasers' rights are performed within

138

twenty-one days or any period expressly allowed by the law,

whichever is less. A transfer to secure a future loan, if such a

loan is actually made, or a transfer which becomes security for a

future loan, has the same effect as a transfer for or on account

of a new and contemporaneous consideration.

148

- (E) If any lien deemed voidable under division (A)(2) of this 144 section has been dissolved by the furnishing of a bond or other 145 obligation, the surety on which has been indemnified directly or 146 indirectly by the transfer of or the creation of a lien upon any 147 property of an insurer before the filing of a complaint under 148 sections 3903.01 to 3903.59 of the Revised Code which results in a 149 liquidation order date, the indemnifying transfer or lien is also 150 deemed voidable. 151
- (F) The property affected by any lien deemed voidable under 152 divisions (A) and (E) of this section is discharged from such 153 lien, and that property and any of the indemnifying property 154 transferred to or for the benefit of a surety passes to the 155 liquidator, except that the court may on due notice order any such 156 lien to be preserved for the benefit of the estate and the court 157 may direct that such conveyance be executed as may be proper or 158 adequate to evidence the title of the liquidator. 159
- (G) The Franklin county court of common pleas has exclusive 160 jurisdiction of any proceeding by the liquidator to hear and 161 determine the rights of any parties under this section. Reasonable 162 notice of any hearing in the proceeding shall be given to all 163 parties in interest, including the obligee of a releasing bond or 164 other like obligation. Where an order is entered for the recovery 165 of indemnifying property in kind or for the avoidance of an 166 indemnifying lien, the court, upon motion of any party in 167 interest, shall may in the same proceeding ascertain the value of 168 the property or lien, and if the value is less than the amount for 169

which the property is indemnity or than the amount of the lien,	170
the transferee or lienholder may elect to retain the property or	171
lien upon payment of its value, as ascertained by the court, to	172
the liquidator, within such reasonable times as the court shall	173
fix.	174

- (H) The liability of a surety under a releasing bond or other 175 like obligation shall be discharged to the extent of the value of 176 the indemnifying property recovered or the indemnifying lien 177 nullified and avoided by the liquidator, or where the property is 178 retained under division (G) of this section to the extent of the 179 amount paid to the liquidator.
- (I) If a creditor has been preferred, and afterward in good
  faith gives the insurer further credit without security of any
  kind, for property which becomes a part of the insurer's estate,
  the amount of the new credit remaining unpaid at the time of the
  complaint may be set off against the preference which would
  otherwise be recoverable from him.

  181

  182

  183

  184

  185
- (J) If an insurer shall, directly or indirectly, within four 187 months one hundred twenty days before the filing of a successful 188 complaint for liquidation under sections 3903.01 to 3903.59 of the 189 Revised Code date, or at any time in contemplation of a proceeding 190 to liquidate it, pay money or transfer property to an 191 attorney-at-law for services rendered or to be rendered, the 192 transaction may be examined by the court on its own motion or 193 shall be examined by the court on motion of the liquidator and 194 shall be held valid only to the extent of a reasonable amount to 195 be determined by the court, and the excess may be recovered by the 196 liquidator for the benefit of the estate provided that where the 197 attorney is in a position of influence in the insurer or an 198 affiliate thereof, payment of any money or the transfer of any 199 property to the attorney-at-law for services rendered or to be 200 rendered shall be governed by the provisions of division (A)(2) of 201

Sub. H. B. No. 282 As Passed by the House	Page 8
this section.	202
(K)(1) Every officer, manager, employee, shareholder, member,	203
subscriber, attorney, or any other person acting on behalf of the	204
insurer who knowingly participates in giving any preference when	205
he has reasonable cause to believe the insurer is or is about to	206
become insolvent at the time of the preference shall be personally	207
liable to the liquidator for the amount of the preference. It	208
shall be presumed that there is reasonable cause to so believe if	209
the transfer was made within four months before the date of filing	210
of the successful complaint for liquidation.	211
(2)(J) As to every transfer subject to avoidance under this	212
section:	213
(1) Every person receiving any property from the insurer or	214
the benefit thereof as a preference voidable under division (A) of	215
this section shall be personally liable for the property and shall	216
be bound to account to the liquidator.	217
(3)(2) The liquidator has the burden of proving that a	218
transfer under division (A)(2) of this section is voidable, and	219
the person against which recovery or voidability is sought has the	220
burden of proving that a transfer under division (A)(4) of this	221
section is not voidable.	222
(3) The fact that the insurer was under examination,	223
supervision, or other regulatory oversight by the department of	224
insurance, or that the department may have acquiesced in or	225
approved any payments made by the insurer, does not effect or	226
otherwise create a defense to avoidance of a transfer voidable	227
under this section.	228
(K) Nothing in this division shall be construed to prejudice	229
any other claim by the liquidator against any person.	230
(L) As used in this section:	231

Sub. H. B. No. 282

business or the exercise of any power of the stabilization reserve

321

Sub. H. B. No. 282

fund. The directors shall serve without salary, but each director	322
shall be reimbursed for actual and necessary expenses incurred in	323
the performance of official duties as a director of the	324
stabilization reserve fund. The directors are not subject to any	325
personal liability with respect to administration of the fund.	326
(C) Each policyholder of the medical liability underwriting	327
association shall pay to the medical liability underwriting	328
association annually a stabilization reserve fund charge. The	329
charge shall be determined by the directors with the agreement of	330
the board of governors of the medical liability underwriting	331
association, subject to the approval of the superintendent. In the	332
event that there is no agreement among the directors, the board of	333
governors, and the superintendent as to the charge, the	334
superintendent shall determine the charge. The amount of the	335
charge may differentiate between types of coverage, but shall be	336
sufficient to ensure that the medical liability underwriting	337
association is actuarially sound, adequately reserved, financially	338
stable, and efficiently managed so as to satisfy the purposes of	339
sections 3929.62 to 3929.70 of the Revised Code. The medical	340
liability underwriting association shall cancel the policy of any	341
policyholder who fails to pay the stabilization reserve fund	342
charge.	343
(D) The medical liability underwriting association promptly	344
shall pay to the trustee of the stabilization reserve fund all	345
stabilization reserve fund charges that it collects from its	346
policyholders.	347
(E) All money received by the stabilization reserve fund	348
shall be held in trust by a corporate trustee selected by the	349
directors. The corporate trustee may invest the money held in	350
trust, subject to the approval of the directors. All investment	351
income shall be credited to the stabilization reserve fund. All	352
expenses of administration of the stabilization reserve fund shall	353

be charged against the stabilization reserve fund. The money held	
in trust shall be used for the purpose of reimbursing the medical	
liability underwriting association for any deficit that arises out	
of the operations of the medical liability underwriting	
association and for any other purpose that is approved by the	
board of directors, if the purpose is reasonably consistent with	
the purposes of the association. Such payment to the medical	
liability underwriting association shall be made by the directors	
upon the medical liability underwriting association's	
certification to the directors of the amount due.	
(F) If the board of governors determines that the moneys	
contained in the stabilization reserve fund at the end of a fiscal	
year, exclusive of dollars allocated for pending claims and after	
payment of all claims and expenses, are in excess of amounts that	
are necessary to ensure that the medical liability underwriting	
association is actuarially sound, adequately reserved, financially	
stable, and efficiently managed as to satisfy the purposes of	
sections 3929.62 to 3929.70 of the Revised Code, and the	
superintendent concurs, the superintendent shall cause the return	
of the excess fund moneys to applicants that have contributed to	
the fund and that are not medical liability underwriting	
association policyholders at the end of the fiscal year. In	
effectuating the return of fund moneys, the superintendent shall	
ascertain the total amount contributed to the fund by each	
applicant during the entire period of the fund's existence. Within	
a reasonable time period not to exceed one year, the	
superintendent shall remit to each eligible applicant an amount	
that bears the same ratio to the total amount of excess fund	
moneys as the total amount contributed to the fund by each	
applicant bears to the total amount contributed to the fund by all	
applicants. Notwithstanding the return of moneys under this	
division policyholders shall continue to be subject to the	

Sub. H. B. No. 282

As Passed by the House

underwriting association's board of governors.	447
(2) Of the initial member appointments made under division	448
(A)(1) of this section, three shall be for terms of one year,	449
three shall be for terms of two years, and three shall be for	450
terms of three years, with the members' terms determined from the	451
date the medical liability underwriting association is created	452
under section 3929.63 of the Revised Code. Thereafter, terms of	453
office for appointed members shall be for three years, each term	454
ending on the same day of the same month of the year as did the	455
term it succeeds. A vacancy shall be filled in the same manner as	456
the original appointment. Members may be reappointed to the board	457
of governors.	458
(B) The board of governors may employ, compensate, and	459
prescribe the duties and powers of as many employees and	460
consultants as are necessary to carry out the purposes of sections	461
3929.62 to 3929.70 of the Revised Code.	462
Sec. 3929.65. (A)(1) Within forty-five days after the	463
creation or a reactivation of the medical liability underwriting	464
association, the board of governors of the medical liability	465
underwriting association shall submit to the superintendent of	466
insurance, for the superintendent's review, a proposed plan of	467
operation consistent with sections 3929.62 to 3929.70 of the	468
Revised Code. The superintendent may adopt this plan by rule	469
promulgated in accordance with Chapter 119. of the Revised Code.	470
If the superintendent does not adopt the plan within thirty days	471
of its submission, the superintendent shall formulate a plan of	472
operation consistent with sections 3929.62 to 3929.70 of the	473
Revised Code. Subsequent to the termination of the thirty-day	474
period, the superintendent shall establish the plan by rule in the	475
minimum time permitted by Chapter 119. of the Revised Code.	476

(2) At any time after the adoption of a plan of operation	47
under division (A)(1) of this section, the board of governors may	47
submit proposals for amendments to the plan of operation to the	47
superintendent for the superintendent's approval. The	48
superintendent also may propose amendments to the plan of	48
operation. All amendments to the plan of operation shall be	48
consistent with sections 3929.62 to 3929.70 of the Revised Code	48
and shall be adopted as rules in accordance with Chapter 119. of	48
the Revised Code.	48
(B) The plan of operation shall provide for economic, fair,	48
and nondiscriminatory administration and for the prompt and	48
efficient provision of medical liability insurance, and shall	48
contain other provisions, including, but not limited to,	48
provisions relating to all of the following:	49
(1) Establishment of necessary facilities;	49
(2) Management of the medical liability underwriting	49
association;	49
(3) Reasonable and objective underwriting standards;	49
(4) Acceptance and cession of reinsurance;	49
(5) The appointment of servicing carriers or the direct	49
issuance of syndicate policies;	49
(6) The issuance of a binder providing coverage for which an	49
applicant tenders an amount equal to the annual premium as	49
estimated by the medical liability underwriting association.	50
(C) The medical liability underwriting association shall	50
separately code all policies written so that appropriate records	50
may be compiled for purposes of calculating the adequate premium	50
levels for each classification of risk. The plan of operation	50
shall set forth the manner in which policies are coded.	50

Sec. 3929.66. (A) Any applicant practicing or operating in	506
this state seeking to purchase medical liability insurance being	507
offered by the medical liability underwriting association, on or	508
after the effective date of the medical liability underwriting	509
association's plan of operation, may apply to the medical	510
liability underwriting association for medical liability	511
insurance. The application may be made on behalf of an applicant	512
by a broker or agent authorized by the applicant, or may be made	513
on behalf of a number of eligible applicants who are members of a	514
medical society.	515
(B) The board of governors of the medical liability	516
underwriting association, in formulating the plan of operation	517
under section 3929.641 of the Revised Code, shall include minimum	518
eligibility and underwriting standards for applicants. If the	519
medical liability underwriting association determines that an	520
applicant meets the eligibility and underwriting standards of the	521
medical liability underwriting association as prescribed in the	522
plan of operation and there is no unpaid, uncontested premium due	523
to the medical liability underwriting association from the	524
applicant for prior medical liability insurance, the medical	525
liability underwriting association, upon receipt of the premium,	526
or such portion thereof as is prescribed in the plan of operation,	527
shall issue a policy of medical liability insurance for a term of	528
one year.	529
(C) The medical liability underwriting association is under	530
no obligation to issue any policy of insurance to any applicant	531
who fails to meet the medical liability underwriting association's	532
eligibility and underwriting standards.	533
(D) The rates, rating plans, rating rules, rating	534
classifications, territories, and policy forms applicable to the	535
insurance written by the medical liability underwriting	536

association and related statistics are subject to Chapter 3937. of	537
the Revised Code and shall be established by the board of	538
governors subject to the approval of the superintendent of	539
insurance, giving due consideration to the past and prospective	540
loss and expense experience for medical liability insurance sold	541
by insurers in this state, trends in the frequency and severity of	542
losses, and such other information as the superintendent may	543
require. All rates shall be on an actuarially sound basis, and	544
shall be calculated to be self-supporting exclusive of any amounts	545
held by the stabilization reserve fund. There shall be a	546
presumption that the rates filed and premiums for the business of	547
the medical liability underwriting association are not	548
unreasonable or excessive. The superintendent shall take all	549
appropriate steps to make available to the medical liability	550
underwriting association the profit, loss, and expense experience	551
of insurers currently or previously writing medical liability	552
insurance in this state.	553
(E) All policies issued by or on behalf of the medical	554
liability underwriting association shall be written so as to apply	555
only to death, disease, or injury which results from acts or	556
omissions covered by the policy and reported during the policy	557
period and for which written claim is made against the insured,	558
unless otherwise provided for in the plan of operation.	559
(F) All policies issued by or on behalf of the medical	560
liability underwriting association shall contain a provision that	561
upon termination of the policy through cancellation on grounds	562
other than nonpayment of premiums, or through retirement or death	563
of the insured, the insured or the insured's estate has the right	564
on payment of appropriate additional premiums to extend coverage	565
to include claims covered by the policy and discovered and	566
reported after the policy period and for which written claim is	567
made against the insured.	568

Sec. 3929.661. The medical liability underwriting association	569
may offer policyholders the option of being liable as a co-insurer	570
on sums paid out by way of settlement or judgment against the	571
policyholder on any claim made under the policy. The medical	572
liability underwriting association has sole authority to settle	573
any claim subject to the co-insurance option without the consent	574
of the insured. The plan of operation shall set forth the terms	575
and conditions of the optional co-insurance coverage.	576
Sec. 3929.67. (A) A medical liability insurance policy that	577
insures a physician, written by or on behalf of the medical	578
liability underwriting association pursuant to sections 3929.62 to	579
3929.70 of the Revised Code, may only be cancelled during the term	580
of the policy for one of the following reasons:	581
(1) Nonpayment of premiums;	582
(2) The license of the insured to practice medicine and	583
surgery or osteopathic medicine and surgery has been suspended or	584
revoked;	585
(3) The insured's failure to meet minimum underwriting	586
standards;	587
(4) The occurrence of a change in the individual risk that	588
substantially increases any hazard insured against after the	589
coverage has been issued or renewed, except to the extent that the	590
insurer reasonably should have foreseen the change or contemplated	591
the risk in writing the policy.	592
(B) A medical liability insurance policy that insures a	593
hospital, written by or on behalf of the medical liability	594
underwriting association pursuant to sections 3929.62 to 3929.70	595
of the Revised Code, may only be cancelled during the term of the	596
policy for one of the following reasons:	597

(1) Nonpayment of premiums;	598
(2) The hospital is not certified or accredited in accordance	599
with Chapter 3727. of the Revised Code;	600
(3) An injunction against the hospital has been granted under	601
section 3727.05 of the Revised Code;	602
(4) The occurrence of a change in the individual risk that	603
substantially increases any hazard insured against after the	604
coverage has been issued or renewed, except to the extent that the	605
insurer reasonably should have foreseen the change or contemplated	606
the risk in writing the policy.	607
Sec. 3929.68. There shall be no liability imposed on the part	608
of, and no cause of action of any nature arises against, the	609
medical liability underwriting association or the stabilization	610
reserve fund, its board of governors, directors, agents, or	611
employees, an insurer or its employees, any licensed agent or	612
broker, or the superintendent of insurance or the superintendent's	613
authorized representatives and employees, for any action taken by	614
them in the performance of their powers and duties under sections	615
3929.62 to 3929.70 of the Revised Code. Any reports and	616
communications made in connection with those actions are not	617
public records.	618
Sec. 3929.681. Any insurer or other person aggrieved by any	619
action or decision of the medical liability underwriting	620
association may appeal to the board of governors. The decision of	621
the board of governors may be appealed to the superintendent of	622
insurance within thirty days from the date of the action or the	623
decision. The superintendent shall, after a hearing held upon	624
proper notice, issue an order approving or disapproving the action	625
or decision, with respect to the matter that is the subject of	626
appeal. All final orders and decisions of the superintendent are	627

subject to judicial review as provided in Chapter 119. of the	628
Revised Code.	629
Sec. 3929.682. (A) A medical liability fund is hereby created	630
in the state treasury. The medical liability fund shall consist of	631
the remaining funds of the joint underwriting association, the	632
association created under section 3929.72 of the Revised Code and	633
dissolved under section 3929.721 of the Revised Code, and shall be	634
used for the purposes of funding the medical liability	635
underwriting association that is created in accordance with	636
sections 3929.62 to 3929.70 of the Revised Code or for funding	637
another medical malpractice initiative with the approval of the	638
general assembly.	639
(B) As used in this section, "remaining funds of the joint	640
underwriting association means funds paid to the treasurer of	641
state in accordance with section 3929.721 of the Revised Code and	642
any plan of dissolution or trust agreement adopted under section	643
3929.721 of the Revised Code.	644
Sec. 3929.69. (A) Annually on or before the first day of	645
March, the medical liability underwriting association shall file	646
in the office of the superintendent of insurance a statement	647
containing information with respect to its transactions,	648
condition, operations, and affairs during the preceding year. The	649
statement shall contain such matters and information as are	650
prescribed and shall be in a form approved by the superintendent.	651
(B) The superintendent or any person designated by the	652
superintendent, at any time, may visit and examine the operation	653
and experience of the medical liability underwriting association.	654
The association shall give the superintendent or the	655
superintendent's designee free access to all the books, records,	656
files, papers, and documents that relate to the operation of the	657

697

698

699

(B) The Superintendent of Insurance shall certify to the	686
Director of Budget and Management the amount of cash deposited	687
from the remaining funds of the Joint Underwriting Association to	688
the General Revenue Fund. Notwithstanding section 3929.721 of the	689
Revised Code, the Director of Budget and Management shall transfer	690
an amount equal to the certified amount from the General Revenue	691
Fund to the Medical Liability Fund created in section 3929.682 of	692
the Revised Code. The amount transferred is hereby appropriated in	693
fiscal year 2004. Any unencumbered and unallocated balances are	694
hereby reappropriated in fiscal year 2005.	695
This section is not subject to the referendum. Therefore,	696

under Ohio Constitution, Article II, Section 1d and section 1.471

of the Revised Code, this section goes into immediate effect when

this act becomes law.