As Reported by the House Local and Municipal Government and Urban Revitalization Committee

127th General Assembly Regular Session 2007-2008

Sub. H. B. No. 459

Representative Hottinger

Cosponsors: Representatives McGregor, J., Fessler, Gardner, Evans, Combs, Flowers, Uecker

ABILL

| To amend section 313.19 of the Revised Code to | 1 |
|--|---|
| establish procedures for the commencement, | 2 |
| determination, and appeal of an action to change a | 3 |
| death certificate or coroner's verdict. | 4 |

BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:

| Section 1. That section 313.19 of the Revised Code be amended | 5 |
|---|----|
| to read as follows: | б |
| | |
| Sec. 313.19. (A) As used in this section: | 7 |
| (1) "Decedent" means the person whose death is recorded on a | 8 |
| death certificate. | 9 |
| (2)(a) "Interested party" means a person that has a | 10 |
| substantial interest in the correctness of a death certificate or | 11 |
| coroner's verdict and includes, but is not limited to: | 12 |
| (i) The spouse of the decedent at the time of the decedent's | 13 |
| death; | 14 |
| (ii) A natural or adoptive parent of the decedent; | 15 |
| (iii) A natural or adopted child of the decedent, or a parent | 16 |

| Sub. H. B. No. 459 As Reported by the House Local and Municipal Government and Urban Revitalization Committee | Page 2 |
|---|--------|
| of the natural or adopted child; | 17 |
| (iv) An executor or other fiduciary appointed by a court to | 18 |
| <u>care for the decedent's estate;</u> | 19 |
| (v) The prosecuting attorney of the county in which the death | 20 |
| certificate for the decedent was filed. | 21 |
| (b) "Interested party" does not include any of the following: | 22 |
| (i) A person who has been convicted of or pleaded guilty to | 23 |
| any offense related to the death of the decedent unless and until | 24 |
| the conviction is overturned, vacated, or otherwise set aside and | 25 |
| the action overturning, vacating, or otherwise setting aside the | 26 |
| conviction is not subject to further appeal or trial; | 27 |
| (ii) A person, other than a prosecuting attorney, who in the | 28 |
| court's opinion is acting solely on behalf of another person who | 29 |
| is not an interested party in order to advance the claims of the | 30 |
| other person. | 31 |
| (3) "Substantial interest" means a contractual or other | 32 |
| financial interest of the person asserting the substantial | 33 |
| interest or of that person's heirs in the correctness of the death | 34 |
| certificate or coroner's verdict. "Substantial interest" also | 35 |
| <u>means an emotional interest based upon a close familial</u> | 36 |
| relationship to the decedent and an interest based upon the death | 37 |
| certificate or coroner's verdict exposing the person to a | 38 |
| substantial possibility of civil liability for wrongful death, a | 39 |
| products liability claim, or other similar civil liability. | 40 |
| (4) "Offense related to the death of the decedent" means any | 41 |
| of the following: | 42 |
| (a) Aggravated murder, murder, voluntary manslaughter, | 43 |
| involuntary manslaughter, reckless homicide, negligent homicide, | 44 |
| aggravated vehicular homicide, vehicular homicide, or vehicular | 45 |
| manslaughter; | 46 |

| Sub. H. B. No. 459 |
|---|
| As Reported by the House Local and Municipal Government and Urban |
| Revitalization Committee |

| (b) An attempt to commit, complicity in committing, or | 47 |
|---|----|
| conspiracy to commit any of the offenses listed in division | 48 |
| (A)(4)(a) of this section; | 49 |
| (c) Perjury, obstructing justice, or tampering with evidence | 50 |
| in relation to any offense listed in division (A)(4)(a) or (b) of | 51 |
| this section; | 52 |
| (d) Violating any law of this state or any municipal | 53 |
| ordinance that is substantially similar to any offense described | 54 |
| in division (A)(4)(a), (b), or (c) of this section; | 55 |
| <u>(e) Violating any law of this state or any municipal</u> | 56 |
| ordinance that is a criminal offense in which the death of another | 57 |
| <u>is an element.</u> | 58 |
| (5) "Person" means an individual, political subdivision of | 59 |
| the state, governmental entity of the state, corporation, business | 60 |
| <u>trust, estate, partnership, or association.</u> | 61 |
| (B) The cause of death and the manner and mode in which the | 62 |
| death occurred, as delivered by the coroner and incorporated in | 63 |
| the coroner's verdict and in the death certificate filed with the | 64 |
| division of vital statistics, shall be the legally accepted manner | 65 |
| and mode in which such death occurred, and the legally accepted | 66 |
| cause of death, unless <u>pursuant to this section</u> the court of | 67 |
| common pleas of the county in which the death occurred, after a | 68 |
| hearing, directs the coroner to change his <u>the coroner's</u> decision | 69 |
| as to such cause and manner and mode of death. <u>In any action or</u> | 70 |
| proceeding in which the cause of death and the manner and mode in | 71 |
| which the death occurred is a genuinely contested issue, no trier | 72 |
| of fact shall presume the correctness of a death certificate or | 73 |
| coroner's verdict. | 74 |
| (C) A goronor may modify a death gortificate or goronorig | 75 |

(C) A coroner may modify a death certificate or coroner's75verdict as allowed by law, but no court shall order a modification76of a death certificate or coroner's verdict except pursuant to77

this section.

78

108

| (D) An interested party may seek relief under this section by | 79 |
|--|-----|
| filing a petition within three years after the decedent's death. | 80 |
| The three-year period is not tolled by the pendency of a criminal | 81 |
| prosecution, proceeding for post-conviction relief, or appeal | 82 |
| related to the death of the decedent. The petitioner shall name as | 83 |
| a respondent the county coroner of the county in which the death | 84 |
| certificate was filed and all other persons whom a diligent search | 85 |
| would reveal to be interested parties if the Rules of Civil | 86 |
| Procedure require the joinder. A petition may include as a | 87 |
| respondent any interested party whose joinder is permitted by the | 88 |
| Rules of Civil Procedure. The petition shall state in detail the | 89 |
| relief sought and be accompanied by affidavits supporting the | 90 |
| claims contained in the petition. If any issue raised in the | 91 |
| petition addresses matters that require expert opinion, one or | 92 |
| more of the affidavits shall be made by an expert whose | 93 |
| qualifications, as shown in the affidavit, appear to comply with | 94 |
| the provisions of the Rules of Evidence concerning expert | 95 |
| testimony. The petition shall be served in accordance with the | 96 |
| Rules of Civil Procedure. | 97 |
| (E)(1) Except as provided in division (K) of this section, no | 98 |
| court shall hear a petition that is not filed within the time | 99 |
| prescribed by this section or extend the time within which a | 100 |
| petition may be filed. The court may dismiss any petition that | 101 |
| fails to properly join and serve any interested party required to | 102 |
| be joined if it appears to the court that the petitioner, through | 103 |
| a diligent search, should have identified that party as an | 104 |
| interested party, and after being alerted to the failure to join | 105 |
| an interested party by the court or by another party, the | 106 |
| petitioner fails to make reasonable efforts to join the interested | 107 |

<u>party.</u>

(2) A court with which a petition has been filed under this 109

| section shall dismiss the petition without a hearing if the | 110 |
|---|-----|
| petition and accompanying affidavits present only evidence that is | 111 |
| substantially the same as evidence that was used or available for | 112 |
| use in a prior criminal proceeding or related collateral | 113 |
| proceeding by any interested party and if the court in the prior | 114 |
| proceeding entered a judgment adverse to that interested party's | 115 |
| <u>claim. Evidence shall not be deemed unavailable for use in a prior</u> | 116 |
| criminal proceeding or related collateral proceeding solely | 117 |
| because it was not presented in that proceeding or was excluded | 118 |
| from consideration by the trier of fact in that proceeding on | 119 |
| procedural grounds. | 120 |
| (3) In an action brought under this section, the court, in | 121 |
| its discretion and on any terms that it considers appropriate, may | 122 |
| permit a person, except a person described in division | 123 |
| (A)(2)(b)(i) of this section, that would not otherwise qualify as | 124 |
| an interested party to be joined as a permissible party and to | 125 |
| participate in the action if the court determines that the joinder | 126 |
| of the person is necessary to protect the interests of the person. | 127 |
| <u>A court's decision to grant or deny a request for joinder of a</u> | 128 |
| permissible party is final and not appealable. | 129 |
| (F)(1) If a petition is filed in a timely manner pursuant to | 130 |
| this section during the pendency of a criminal prosecution, | 131 |
| proceeding for post-conviction relief, or appeal related to the | 132 |
| death of the decedent, upon motion of the prosecuting attorney, if | 133 |
| the petitioner is a person charged with an offense related to the | 134 |
| death of the decedent, the court shall stay the proceedings on the | 135 |
| petition until the defendant in the criminal prosecution, the | 136 |
| petitioner in the proceeding for post-conviction relief, or the | 137 |
| appellant in the appeal has exhausted the defendant's, | 138 |
| petitioner's, or appellant's state and federal rights of direct | 139 |
| appeal and collateral review. No court shall stay or continue the | 140 |
| proceedings if the stay or continuance would unduly prejudice the | 141 |
| | |

Page 5

| rights of any other interested party joined in the action at the | 142 |
|--|-----|
| time of the petition. | 143 |
| (2) Upon motion of the prosecuting attorney, the court may | 144 |
| stay the proceedings on any petition in which the petitioner is | 145 |
| not a person charged with an offense related to the death of the | 146 |
| decedent, if the court finds that further proceedings could | 147 |
| compromise a criminal prosecution, proceeding for post-conviction | 148 |
| relief, or appeal related to the death of the decedent, unless | 149 |
| such a stay or a continuance would unduly prejudice the rights of | 150 |
| any other interested party. | 151 |
| (G)(1) If the court finds that a petition filed pursuant to | 152 |
| this section meets all of the requirements set forth in this | 153 |
| section, the court shall set the petition for hearing. Before the | 154 |
| hearing the court may, but need not, do any of the following: | 155 |
| (a) Require that the coroner or any other party file and | 156 |
| serve an answer to the petition; | 157 |
| (b) Grant to any party the right to conduct discovery under | 158 |
| the Rules of Civil Procedure; | 159 |
| (c) Permit the filing of, and rule upon, any motions | 160 |
| authorized by the Rules of Civil Procedure; | 161 |
| (d) Issue any order that the court considers necessary to a | 162 |
| fair determination. | 163 |
| (2) At the hearing the petitioner shall have the burden of | 164 |
| going forward with evidence and shall have the burden of proving | 165 |
| by a preponderance of the evidence that the death certificate or | 166 |
| coroner's verdict is in error. The hearing shall be conducted | 167 |
| without a jury and in accordance with the Rules of Evidence. | 168 |
| (H) A dismissal of a petition for failure to comply with any | 169 |
| of the provisions of this section, or for failure of proof after a | 170 |
| hearing, is a dismissal with prejudice to the filing of another | 171 |

| petition related to the death certificate or coroner's verdict in | 172 |
|---|-----|
| question by all named petitioners and against all persons whose | 173 |
| interest is in privity with any of the petitioners and all joined | 174 |
| parties. | 175 |
| (I) If a party to an action brought under this section | 176 |
| appeals the final decision of the court, the court of appeals | 177 |
| shall do one of the following: | 178 |
| (a) If the final decision modifies the death certificate or | 179 |
| <u>coroner's verdict, conduct a review de novo;</u> | 180 |
| (b) If the final decision affirms the correctness of the | 181 |
| death certificate or coroner's verdict, determine whether the | 182 |
| trial court abused its discretion with regard to an appealable | 183 |
| matter and either affirm the decision or remand the case to the | 184 |
| trial court for further proceedings. | 185 |
| (J) No change in a death certificate or coroner's verdict | 186 |
| made pursuant to this section shall be the basis of a new trial | 187 |
| for, or the withdrawal of any plea to, any offense related to the | 188 |
| death of the decedent unless a court determines a change in a | 189 |
| death certificate or coroner's verdict to be a proper basis in a | 190 |
| criminal case for postconviction relief under sections 2953.21 to | 191 |
| 2953.23 of the Revised Code. | 192 |
| (K) The prosecuting attorney may file a petition beyond the | 193 |
| time period prescribed in division (E) of this section, or may | 194 |
| file a subsequent or successive petition, upon the discovery of | 195 |
| new evidence that, in the opinion of the prosecuting attorney, | 196 |
| warrants such a filing in order to correct a manifest injustice. | 197 |
| Any other interested party may file a petition beyond the time | 198 |
| period prescribed in division (E) of this section only upon the | 199 |
| discovery of new evidence that the petitioner was unavoidably | 200 |
| prevented from discovering within that time period. | 201 |
| | |

(L) Nothing in this section shall be construed or applied to 202

| give a person charged with an offense related to the death of the | 203 |
|---|-----|
| decedent any right to conduct discovery or to have access to | 204 |
| discovery beyond that which the person is entitled under the law | 205 |
| as applicable to a criminal prosecution. | 206 |

section 2. That existing section 313.19 of the Revised Code 207
is hereby repealed. 208

section 3. This act is intended to be a remedial measure. It 209 is the General Assembly's specific intent that those provisions of 210 this act that prohibit a person who has been convicted of or 211 pleaded guilty to any offense related to the death of a decedent 212 from maintaining an action under this act, unless and until the 213 conviction is overturned, vacated, or otherwise set aside and the 214 action overturning, vacating, or otherwise setting aside the 215 conviction is not subject to further appeal or trial, as well as 216 the provisions that require or permit a stay of proceedings on a 217 petition during the pendancy of a criminal prosecution, proceeding 218 for post-conviction relief, or appeal related to the death of the 219 decedent, shall be applied retrospectively to all cases filed 220 under section 313.19 of the Revised Code, whether or not the case 221 is pending on the effective date of this act. All other provisions 222 of this act shall govern all proceedings in actions brought after 223 the effective date of this act and also all further proceedings in 224 actions pending on that date, except if in the court's opinion the 225 application of those provisions in a particular action would not 226 be feasible or would cause injustice, in which event former 227 procedures apply. 228