

**As Introduced**

**128th General Assembly  
Regular Session  
2009-2010**

**H. B. No. 122**

**Representative Boyd**

—

**A BILL**

To enact sections 3964.01, 3964.02, 3964.05 to 1  
3964.07, 3964.10 to 3964.12, 3964.15 to 3964.17, 2  
3964.21 to 3964.24, and 5111.0210 of the Revised 3  
Code to establish standards for physician 4  
designations by health care insurers. 5

**BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:**

**Section 1.** That sections 3964.01, 3964.02, 3964.05, 3964.06, 6  
3964.07, 3964.10, 3964.11, 3964.12, 3964.15, 3964.16, 3964.17, 7  
3964.21, 3964.22, 3964.23, 3964.24, and 5111.0210 of the Revised 8  
Code be enacted to read as follows: 9

**Sec. 3964.01.** As used in this chapter: 10

(A) "Health care insurer" means an entity that offers a 11  
policy, contract, or plan for covering the cost of health care 12  
services for individuals who are beneficiaries of or enrolled in 13  
the policy, contract, or plan, to the extent that the entity and 14  
the policy, contract, or plan are subject to the laws of this 15  
state. "Health care entity" includes all of the following: 16

(1) A sickness and accident insurance company authorized to 17  
do the business of insurance in this state; 18

(2) A health insuring corporation that holds a certificate of 19  
authority issued under Chapter 1751. of the Revised Code; 20

(3) An entity that offers a multiple employer welfare arrangement, as defined in section 1739.01 of the Revised Code; 21  
22

(4) The state, a political subdivision, or any other government entity that offers a public employee health benefit plan. 23  
24  
25

(B) "Physician" means an individual authorized under Chapter 4731. of the Revised Code to practice medicine and surgery or osteopathic medicine and surgery. 26  
27  
28

(C) "Physician designation" means a grade, star, tier, or any other rating used by a health care insurer to characterize or represent the insurer's assessment or measurement of a physician's cost efficiency, quality of care, or clinical performance. 29  
30  
31  
32

"Physician designation" does not include either of the following: 33

(1) Information derived solely from satisfaction surveys or other comments provided by individuals who are beneficiaries of or enrolled in a policy, contract, or plan offered by a health care insurer; 34  
35  
36  
37

(2) Information for a program established by a health care insurer to assist individuals with estimating a physician's routine fees for providing services. 38  
39  
40

**Sec. 3964.02.** If a health care insurer operates a system for making physician designations, all of the following apply with respect to each physician designation that is made: 41  
42  
43

(A) The health care insurer shall include a quality-of-care component in making the physician designation. Inclusion of the quality-of-care component may be satisfied by incorporating one or more practice guidelines or performance measures pursuant to division (F) of this section. The resulting designation shall include a clear description of the weight given to the quality-of-care component in comparison to other factors used in 44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

making the designation. 51

(B) The health care insurer shall use statistical analyses in 52  
making the physician designation. The insurer shall use 53  
statistical analyses that are accurate, valid, and reliable. Where 54  
reasonably possible, the insurer shall use statistical analyses 55  
that have been appropriately adjusted to reflect known statistical 56  
anomalies, including factors pertaining to patient population, 57  
case mix, severity of condition, comorbidities, and outlier 58  
events. 59

(C) The health care insurer shall make a physician 60  
designation only after completing a period of assessment of data 61  
pertinent to the designation. The insurer shall update the data at 62  
appropriate intervals. 63

(D) If data from claims for payment are used in making the 64  
physician designation, the health care insurer shall use accurate 65  
claims data and attribute the data appropriately to the physician. 66  
If reasonably available, aggregated claims data shall be used to 67  
supplement the insurer's claims data. 68

(E) The health care insurer shall make the physician 69  
designation in a manner that recognizes the physician's 70  
responsibility for making health care decisions and the financial 71  
consequences of those decisions. The financial consequences of the 72  
physician's health care decisions shall be attributed to the 73  
physician in a manner that is accurate and fair to the physician. 74

(F) If practice guidelines or performance measures are used 75  
in making the physician designation, the health care insurer shall 76  
use guidelines or measures that are evidence-based, whenever 77  
possible; consensus-based, whenever possible; and pertinent to the 78  
physician's area of practice, location, and patient-population 79  
characteristics. To the maximum extent possible, the insurer shall 80  
use practice guidelines or performance measures that have been 81

established by nationally recognized health care organizations, 82  
including the national quality forum or its successor, or the AOA 83  
alliance or its successor. 84

Sec. 3964.05. Except as provided in section 3964.06 of the 85  
Revised Code, a health care insurer may disclose any or all of its 86  
physician designations to any of the following: 87

(A) A physician; 88

(B) A patient or potential patient; 89

(C) An individual who is or may become a beneficiary of or 90  
enrolled in a health care policy, contract, or plan offered by the 91  
insurer; 92

(D) Any other individual. 93

Sec. 3964.06. (A) When a health care insurer makes a 94  
physician designation, including a change in a designation, the 95  
insurer shall notify the physician before disclosing the 96  
designation to the public. The notice shall be provided in writing 97  
and shall inform the physician of both of the following: 98

(1) The process by which the physician may request 99  
information under sections 3964.10 and 3964.11 of the Revised Code 100  
regarding the method and data used in making the designation; 101

102

(2) The opportunity to request an appeal of the designation 103  
pursuant to section 3964.15 of the Revised Code. 104

(B) After providing the written notice required under 105  
division (A) of this section, the health care insurer shall not 106  
disclose the physician designation until the latest occurring of 107  
the following: 108

(1) Forty-five days after providing the notice; 109

(2) Fifteen days after fulfilling any request for information 110  
under section 3964.10 of the Revised Code; 111

(3) Fifteen days after fulfilling any request for information 112  
under section 3964.11 of the Revised Code; 113

(4) The date that the designation is in compliance with a 114  
final decision made pursuant to an appeal requested under section 115  
3964.15 of the Revised Code. 116

**Sec. 3964.07.** (A) When a health care insurer discloses a 117  
physician designation under section 3964.05 of the Revised Code, 118  
the insurer shall include with the disclosure a statement 119  
specifying all of the following: 120

(1) That physician designations are intended to be used only 121  
as a guide in selecting a physician; 122

(2) That physician designations should not be the sole factor 123  
used in selecting a physician; 124

(3) That physician designations have a risk of error; 125

(4) That individuals should discuss physician designations 126  
with a physician before a selection is made. 127

(B) The statement required by this section shall accompany 128  
the disclosure of the physician designation in a conspicuous 129  
manner, shall be provided in writing, and shall be printed in 130  
boldface type. 131

**Sec. 3964.10.** (A) Any of the following may submit a request 132  
to a health care insurer asking that the insurer provide a 133  
description of the method used by the insurer in making a 134  
physician designation and, for a particular designation, a 135  
description of all data used in making the designation: 136

(1) The physician who is the subject of the designation; 137

(2) A representative of the physician who is the subject of 138  
the designation; 139

(3) The superintendent of insurance. 140

(B) Not later than forty-five days after receiving a request 141  
under this section, the health care insurer shall provide the 142  
requested information to the person who submitted the request. In 143  
providing the information, the insurer is subject to all of the 144  
following: 145

(1) The description of the method used in making the 146  
physician designation shall be sufficiently detailed to allow the 147  
person who submitted the request to determine the effect of the 148  
method on the data used in making the designation. As applicable, 149  
the description shall include an explanation of the use of 150  
algorithms or studies, the assessment of data, and the application 151  
of practice guidelines or performance measures. 152

(2) The description of the data used in making the physician 153  
designation shall be made in a manner that is reasonably 154  
understandable and allows the person who submitted the request to 155  
verify the data against the person's records. 156

(3) If the health care insurer has a contract with another 157  
person that prevents the insurer from disclosing all or part of 158  
the data used in making the physician designation, the insurer may 159  
withhold the data but shall provide sufficient information to 160  
allow the person who submitted the request to determine how the 161  
withheld data affected the designation. 162

Sec. 3964.11. After receiving a description of a health care 163  
insurer's method used in making a physician designation pursuant 164  
to a request submitted under section 3964.10 of the Revised Code, 165  
the recipient may submit a request to the insurer asking that the 166  
insurer provide the complete method used by the insurer in making 167

the physician designation. 168

Not later than thirty days after receiving a request under 169  
this section, the health care insurer shall provide the requested 170  
information to the person who submitted the request. 171

**Sec. 3964.12.** Neither sections 1333.61 to 1333.69 of the 172  
Revised Code nor any other provision of the Revised Code 173  
pertaining to trade secrets excuses a health care insurer from 174  
complying with sections 3964.10 and 3964.11 of the Revised Code. 175

**Sec. 3964.15.** A health care insurer that operates a system 176  
for making physician designations shall afford a physician who is 177  
subject to the physician designation system an opportunity to 178  
appeal the insurer's decision regarding the physician's 179  
designation, including a decision by the insurer to change a 180  
previous designation or to make no designation. In appealing the 181  
decision, the physician may be assisted by a representative. 182

**Sec. 3964.16.** A health care insurer shall establish 183  
procedures for the conduct of appeals under section 3964.15 of the 184  
Revised Code. At a minimum, the procedures established by the 185  
insurer shall include all of the following: 186

(A) A reasonable method for a physician or a physician's 187  
representative to provide notice to the insurer that an appeal is 188  
being sought; 189

(B) Consideration of any information obtained by the 190  
physician or the physician's representative pursuant to section 191  
3964.10 or 3964.11 of the Revised Code; 192

(C) If requested by the physician or the physician's 193  
representative, consideration of an explanation of the decision 194  
regarding the physician designation, with the explanation supplied 195

by the person or persons identified by the health care insurer as 196  
being responsible for making the designation decision; 197

(D) With respect to the data and method used by the insurer 198  
to make the physician designation decision, an opportunity for the 199  
physician or the physician's representative to submit to the 200  
insurer corrected data for the insurer's consideration and to have 201  
the appropriateness of the method evaluated by the insurer; 202

(E) Disclosure of the name, title, qualifications, and 203  
relationship to the health care insurer of the person or persons 204  
designated by the insurer as responsible for conducting the appeal 205  
proceedings and making the final decision; 206

(F) If requested by the physician or the physician's 207  
representative, an opportunity to meet with the person or persons 208  
responsible for conducting the appeal proceedings and making the 209  
final decision, either by meeting in person at a location 210  
reasonably convenient to the physician or the physician's 211  
representative or by teleconference. 212

(G) Completion of the appeals process not later than 213  
forty-five days after the physician or physician's representative 214  
provides notice that an appeal is being sought, unless another 215  
time is agreed to by the physician or the physician's 216  
representative; 217

(H) Issuance of a written final decision that states the 218  
reasons for upholding, modifying, or rejecting the physician 219  
designation decision subject to the appeal. 220

**Sec. 3964.17.** If the final decision regarding an appeal under 221  
section 3964.15 of the Revised Code is in favor of the physician, 222  
the health care insurer shall modify its designation of the 223  
physician in accordance with the final decision. In modifying the 224  
designation, the insurer is subject to both of the following: 225



226

(A) If the designation was disclosed to the public before the appeal was made, the insurer shall make the necessary changes to the designation not later than thirty days after the final decision regarding the appeal is made. 227  
228  
229  
230

(B) If the designation was not disclosed to the public before the appeal was made, the insurer shall make the necessary changes to the designation before the designation is disclosed to the public. 231  
232  
233  
234

Sec. 3964.21. A health care insurer shall not fail to comply with sections 3964.02 to 3964.17 of the Revised Code. 235  
236

Sec. 3964.22. In the case of a health care insurer that is regulated by the department of insurance, a series of violations of section 3964.21 of the Revised Code that, taken together, constitutes a pattern or practice of violating that section shall be considered an unfair and deceptive act or practice in the business of insurance under sections 3901.19 to 3901.26 of the Revised Code. 237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243

Sec. 3964.23. A physician who is adversely affected by a violation of section 3964.21 of the Revised Code has a cause of action against the health care insurer and may seek a declaratory judgment, an injunction, or other appropriate relief. 244  
245  
246  
247

Sec. 3964.24. Any provision of a contractual arrangement between a health care insurer and physician that limits any of the physician's rights granted by this chapter or that is otherwise contrary to the provisions of this chapter is unenforceable. 248  
249  
250  
251

Sec. 5111.0210. Chapter 3964. of the Revised Code applies to 252

<u>the medicaid program in the same manner that the chapter applies</u>	253
<u>to a health care insurer, as defined in section 3964.01 of the</u>	254
<u>Revised Code.</u>	255