

**As Reported by the House Health Committee**

**128th General Assembly  
Regular Session  
2009-2010**

**Sub. H. B. No. 122**

**Representative Boyd**

**Cosponsors: Representatives Hagan, Letson, Winburn, Slesnick, Yuko**

—

**A B I L L**

To enact sections 3964.01 to 3964.03, 3964.05 to 1  
3964.07, 3964.10 to 3964.12, 3964.15 to 3964.17, 2  
3964.21 to 3964.25, 3964.27, and 5111.0210 of the 3  
Revised Code to establish standards for physician 4  
designations by health care insurers. 5

**BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF OHIO:**

**Section 1.** That sections 3964.01, 3964.02, 3964.03, 3964.05, 6  
3964.06, 3964.07, 3964.10, 3964.11, 3964.12, 3964.15, 3964.16, 7  
3964.17, 3964.21, 3964.22, 3964.23, 3964.24, 3964.25, 3964.27, and 8  
5111.0210 of the Revised Code be enacted to read as follows: 9

**Sec. 3964.01.** As used in this chapter: 10

(A) "Health care insurer" means an entity that offers a 11  
policy, contract, or plan for covering the cost of health care 12  
services for individuals who are beneficiaries of or enrolled in 13  
the policy, contract, or plan, to the extent that the entity and 14  
the policy, contract, or plan are subject to the laws of this 15  
state. "Health care insurer" includes all of the following: 16

(1) A sickness and accident insurance company authorized to 17  
do the business of insurance in this state; 18

(2) A health insuring corporation that holds a certificate of authority issued under Chapter 1751. of the Revised Code; 19  
20

(3) An entity that offers a multiple employer welfare arrangement, as defined in section 1739.01 of the Revised Code; 21  
22

(4) The state, a political subdivision, or any other government entity that offers a public employee health benefit plan. 23  
24  
25

(B) "Physician" means an individual authorized under Chapter 4731. of the Revised Code to practice medicine and surgery or osteopathic medicine and surgery. 26  
27  
28

(C) "Physician designation" means a grade, star, tier, or any other rating used by a health care insurer to characterize or represent the insurer's assessment or measurement of a physician's cost efficiency, quality of care, or clinical performance. 29  
30  
31  
32  
"Physician designation" does not include either of the following: 33

(1) Information derived solely from satisfaction surveys or other comments provided by individuals who are beneficiaries of or enrolled in a policy, contract, or plan offered by a health care insurer; 34  
35  
36  
37

(2) Information for a program established by a health care insurer to assist individuals with estimating a physician's routine fees for providing services. 38  
39  
40

(D) "Third-party administrator" has the same meaning as "administrator" in section 3959.01 of the Revised Code. 41  
42

**Sec. 3964.02.** If a health care insurer operates a system for making physician designations, all of the following apply with respect to each physician designation that is made: 43  
44  
45

(A) The health care insurer shall include a quality-of-care component in making the physician designation. Inclusion of the quality-of-care component may be satisfied by incorporating one or 46  
47  
48

more practice guidelines or performance measures pursuant to 49  
division (F) of this section. The resulting designation shall 50  
include a clear description of the weight given to the 51  
quality-of-care component in comparison to other factors used in 52  
making the designation. 53

(B) The health care insurer shall use statistical analyses in 54  
making the physician designation. The insurer shall use 55  
statistical analyses that are accurate, valid, and reliable. Where 56  
reasonably possible, the insurer shall use statistical analyses 57  
that have been appropriately adjusted to reflect known statistical 58  
anomalies, including factors pertaining to patient population, 59  
case mix, severity of condition, comorbidities, and outlier 60  
events. 61

(C) The health care insurer shall make a physician 62  
designation only after completing a period of assessment of data 63  
pertinent to the designation. The insurer shall update the data at 64  
appropriate intervals. 65

(D) If data from claims for payment are used in making the 66  
physician designation, the health care insurer shall use accurate 67  
claims data and attribute the data appropriately to the physician. 68  
If reasonably available, aggregated claims data shall be used to 69  
supplement the insurer's claims data. 70

(E) The health care insurer shall make the physician 71  
designation in a manner that recognizes the physician's 72  
responsibility for making health care decisions and the financial 73  
consequences of those decisions. The financial consequences of the 74  
physician's health care decisions shall be attributed to the 75  
physician in a manner that is accurate and fair to the physician. 76

(F) If practice guidelines or performance measures are used 77  
in making the physician designation, the health care insurer shall 78  
use guidelines or measures that are evidence-based, whenever 79

possible; consensus-based, whenever possible; and pertinent to the 80  
physician's area of practice, location, and patient-population 81  
characteristics. To the maximum extent possible, the insurer shall 82  
use practice guidelines or performance measures that have been 83  
established by nationally recognized health care organizations, 84  
including the national quality forum or its successor, or the AOA 85  
alliance or its successor. 86

Sec. 3964.03. (A) A health care insurer that operates a 87  
system for making physician designations shall appoint and pay for 88  
an independent ratings examiner, who is approved by the 89  
superintendent of insurance, to ensure that the health care 90  
insurer is in compliance with the requirements of this chapter. 91  
Every six months, the independent ratings examiner shall submit a 92  
report to the superintendent of insurance that describes the 93  
methods used by the insurer in making physician designations and 94  
details the insurer's compliance with this chapter. 95

(B) For purposes of division (A) of this section, the 96  
superintendent shall establish a process for approving independent 97  
ratings examiners. 98

Sec. 3964.05. Except as provided in section 3964.06 of the 99  
Revised Code, a health care insurer may disclose any or all of its 100  
physician designations to any of the following: 101

(A) A physician; 102

(B) A patient or potential patient; 103

(C) An individual who is or may become a beneficiary of or 104  
enrolled in a health care policy, contract, or plan offered by the 105  
insurer; 106

(D) Any other individual. 107

Sec. 3964.06. (A) When a health care insurer makes a 108

physician designation, including a change in a designation, the 109  
insurer shall notify the physician before disclosing the 110  
designation to the public. The notice shall be provided in writing 111  
and shall inform the physician of both of the following: 112

(1) The process by which the physician may request 113  
information under sections 3964.10 and 3964.11 of the Revised Code 114  
regarding the method and data used in making the designation; 115

(2) The opportunity to request an appeal of the designation 117  
pursuant to section 3964.15 of the Revised Code. 118

(B) After providing the written notice required under 119  
division (A) of this section, the health care insurer shall not 120  
disclose the physician designation until the latest occurring of 121  
the following: 122

(1) Ninety days after providing the notice; 123

(2) Thirty days after fulfilling any request for information 124  
under section 3964.10 of the Revised Code; 125

(3) Thirty days after fulfilling any request for information 126  
under section 3964.11 of the Revised Code; 127

(4) The date that the designation is in compliance with a 128  
final decision made pursuant to an appeal requested under section 129  
3964.15 of the Revised Code. 130

**Sec. 3964.07.** (A) When a health care insurer discloses a 131  
physician designation under section 3964.05 of the Revised Code, 132  
the insurer shall include with the disclosure a statement 133  
specifying all of the following: 134

(1) That physician designations are intended to be used only 135  
as a guide in selecting a physician; 136

(2) That physician designations should not be the sole factor 137

<u>used in selecting a physician;</u>	138
<u>(3) That physician designations have a risk of error;</u>	139
<u>(4) That individuals should discuss physician designations with a physician before a selection is made.</u>	140 141
<u>(B) The statement required by this section shall accompany the disclosure of the physician designation in a conspicuous manner, shall be provided in writing, and shall be printed in boldface type.</u>	142 143 144 145
<b><u>Sec. 3964.10.</u></b> <u>(A) Any of the following may submit a request to a health care insurer asking that the insurer provide a description of the method used by the insurer in making a physician designation and, for a particular designation, a description of all data used in making the designation:</u>	146 147 148 149 150
<u>(1) The physician who is the subject of the designation;</u>	151
<u>(2) A representative of the physician who is the subject of the designation;</u>	152 153
<u>(3) The superintendent of insurance.</u>	154
<u>(B) Not later than forty-five days after receiving a request under this section, the health care insurer shall provide the requested information to the person who submitted the request. In providing the information, the insurer is subject to all of the following:</u>	155 156 157 158 159
<u>(1) The description of the method used in making the physician designation shall be sufficiently detailed to allow the person who submitted the request to determine the effect of the method on the data used in making the designation. As applicable, the description shall include an explanation of the use of algorithms or studies, the assessment of data, and the application of practice guidelines or performance measures.</u>	160 161 162 163 164 165 166

(2) The description of the data used in making the physician designation shall be made in a manner that is reasonably understandable and allows the person who submitted the request to verify the data against the person's records. 167  
168  
169  
170

(3) If the health care insurer has a contract with another person that prevents the insurer from disclosing all or part of the data used in making the physician designation, the insurer may withhold the data but shall provide sufficient information to allow the person who submitted the request to determine how the withheld data affected the designation. 171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176

**Sec. 3964.11.** After receiving a description of a health care insurer's method used in making a physician designation pursuant to a request submitted under section 3964.10 of the Revised Code, the recipient may submit a request to the insurer asking that the insurer provide the complete method used by the insurer in making the physician designation. 177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182

Not later than thirty days after receiving a request under this section, the health care insurer shall provide the requested information to the person who submitted the request. 183  
184  
185

**Sec. 3964.12.** Neither sections 1333.61 to 1333.69 of the Revised Code nor any other provision of the Revised Code pertaining to trade secrets excuses a health care insurer from complying with sections 3964.10 and 3964.11 of the Revised Code. 186  
187  
188  
189

**Sec. 3964.15.** A health care insurer that operates a system for making physician designations shall afford a physician who is subject to the physician designation system an opportunity to appeal the insurer's decision regarding the physician's designation, including a decision by the insurer to change a previous designation or to make no designation. In appealing the decision, the physician may be assisted by a representative. 190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196

Except for modifications made in accordance with section 3964.17 of the Revised Code, information regarding an appeal requested under this section shall not be disclosed to the public. 197  
198  
199

Sec. 3964.16. A health care insurer shall establish procedures for the conduct of appeals under section 3964.15 of the Revised Code. At a minimum, the procedures established by the insurer shall include all of the following: 200  
201  
202  
203

(A) A reasonable method for a physician or a physician's representative to provide notice to the insurer that an appeal is being sought; 204  
205  
206

(B) Consideration of any information obtained by the physician or the physician's representative pursuant to section 3964.10 or 3964.11 of the Revised Code; 207  
208  
209

(C) If requested by the physician or the physician's representative, consideration of an explanation of the decision regarding the physician designation, with the explanation supplied by the person or persons identified by the health care insurer as being responsible for making the designation decision; 210  
211  
212  
213  
214

(D) With respect to the data and method used by the insurer to make the physician designation decision, an opportunity for the physician or the physician's representative to submit to the insurer corrected data for the insurer's consideration and to have the appropriateness of the method evaluated by the insurer; 215  
216  
217  
218  
219

(E) Disclosure of the name, title, qualifications, and relationship to the health care insurer of the person or persons designated by the insurer as responsible for conducting the appeal proceedings and making the final decision; 220  
221  
222  
223

(F) If requested by the physician or the physician's representative, an opportunity to meet with the person or persons responsible for conducting the appeal proceedings and making the 224  
225  
226

final decision, either by meeting in person at a location 227  
reasonably convenient to the physician or the physician's 228  
representative or by teleconference. 229

(G) Completion of the appeals process not later than 230  
forty-five days after the physician or physician's representative 231  
provides notice that an appeal is being sought, unless another 232  
time is agreed to by the physician or the physician's 233  
representative; 234

(H) Issuance of a written final decision that states the 235  
reasons for upholding, modifying, or rejecting the physician 236  
designation decision subject to the appeal. 237

**Sec. 3964.17.** If the final decision regarding an appeal under 238  
section 3964.15 of the Revised Code is in favor of the physician, 239  
the health care insurer shall modify its designation of the 240  
physician in accordance with the final decision. In modifying the 241  
designation, the insurer is subject to both of the following: 242  
243

(A) If the designation was disclosed to the public before the 244  
appeal was made, the insurer shall make the necessary changes to 245  
the designation not later than thirty days after the final 246  
decision regarding the appeal is made. 247

(B) If the designation was not disclosed to the public before 248  
the appeal was made, the insurer shall make the necessary changes 249  
to the designation before the designation is disclosed to the 250  
public. 251

**Sec. 3964.21.** A health care insurer shall not fail to comply 252  
with sections 3964.02 to 3964.17 of the Revised Code or any rules 253  
adopted under section 3964.27 of the Revised Code. 254

**Sec. 3964.22.** In the case of a health care insurer that is 255

regulated by the department of insurance, a series of violations 256  
of section 3964.21 of the Revised Code that, taken together, 257  
constitutes a pattern or practice of violating that section shall 258  
be considered an unfair and deceptive act or practice in the 259  
business of insurance under sections 3901.19 to 3901.26 of the 260  
Revised Code. 261

Sec. 3964.23. A physician who is adversely affected by a 262  
violation of section 3964.21 of the Revised Code has a cause of 263  
action against the health care insurer and may seek a declaratory 264  
judgment, an injunction, or other appropriate relief. 265

Sec. 3964.24. Any provision of a contractual arrangement 266  
between a health care insurer and physician that limits any of the 267  
physician's rights granted by this chapter or that is otherwise 268  
contrary to the provisions of this chapter is unenforceable. 269

Sec. 3964.25. This chapter applies to a third-party 270  
administrator in the same manner that the chapter applies to a 271  
health care insurer. 272

Sec. 3964.27. The superintendent of insurance may adopt rules 273  
as the superintendent considers necessary to carry out the 274  
purposes of this chapter. The rules shall be adopted in accordance 275  
with Chapter 119. of the Revised Code. 276

Sec. 5111.0210. Chapter 3964. of the Revised Code applies to 277  
the medicaid program in the same manner that the chapter applies 278  
to a health care insurer, as defined in section 3964.01 of the 279  
Revised Code. 280